Gaseous Chlorine Dioxide as an Alternative for Bedbug Control
Author(s): Shawn G. Gibbs, John J. Lowe, Philip W. Smith, Angela L. Hewlett
Reviewed work(s):
Source: Infection Control and Hospital Epidemiology, (Not available), p. 000
Published by: The University of Chicago Press on behalf of The Society for Healthcare Epidemiology of America
Stable URL: http://www.jstor.org/stable/10.1086/665320
Accessed: 23/03/2012 12:59

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at http://www.jstor.org/page/info/about/policies/terms.jsp
JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.
Objective. This study evaluated the efficacy of gaseous chlorine dioxide (ClO$_2$) for extermination of bedbugs (*Cimex lectularius* and *Cimex hemipterus*).

Background. Bedbugs have received attention because of recent outbreaks. Bedbug eradication is difficult and often requires a time-consuming multifaceted approach.

Setting. Laboratory and hospital room.

Methods. Bedbugs were exposed to concentrations of ClO$_2$ of 362, 724, and 1,086 parts per million (ppm) in an exposure chamber. Bedbug mortality was then evaluated. The ability of ClO$_2$ to penetrate various spaces in a hospital room was evaluated using *Bacillus atropheus* as a surrogate organism.

Results. Concentrations of 1,086 and 724 ppm of ClO$_2$ yielded 100% bedbug mortality assessed immediately after exposure. Live young were not observed for any eggs exposed to ClO$_2$ gas. ClO$_2$ at a concentration of 362 ppm for 1,029 parts per million hours (ppm-hours) achieved 100% mortality 6 hours after exposure. A ClO$_2$ concentration of 362 ppm for 519 ppm-hours had 100% mortality 18 hours after exposure. Up to a 6-log reduction in *B. atropheus* spores was achieved using similar concentrations of ClO$_2$ in a hospital room, indicating that the concentrations needed to kill bedbugs can be achieved throughout a hospital room.

Conclusions. ClO$_2$ is effective at killing bedbugs in the laboratory, and similar concentrations of ClO$_2$ gas can be achieved in a hospital room. ClO$_2$ can be removed from the room without residuals.

Bedbugs (*Cimex lectularius* and *Cimex hemipterus*) have received significant attention because of recent outbreaks. Bedbugs are capable of surviving for several months without an available food source. Infestations have been reported in residential areas, retail stores, and hotels as well as within the healthcare system. Infestations have lead to operational closure of facilities, including healthcare facilities. Human immunodeficiency virus, hepatitis B virus, methicillin-resistant *Staphylococcus aureus*, and other pathogens have been detected in bedbugs. Studies have not demonstrated transmission to humans, but concern remains that bedbugs may serve as vectors for the transmission of infectious diseases. They are classified by the US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) as “a pest of significant public health importance.”

Bedbug eradication is multifaceted and may consist of environmental measures, such as superheating and freezing, as well as the use of chemical measures. Bedbugs are resistant to multiple commercially available pesticides, and the use of conventional pesticides for bedbug control resulted in 39 cases of pesticide poisoning in 2010.

Chlorine dioxide (ClO$_2$) is an effective gaseous decontaminant and was used in US governmental facilities after the 2001 anthrax attacks. ClO$_2$ has the potential to reach small cracks and crevices where bedbugs reside, but its effect on bedbugs has not been investigated. ClO$_2$ can be removed from the environment after treatment to reduce concerns associated with chemical residuals. This study evaluated the efficacy of gaseous ClO$_2$ in extermination of bedbugs.
Chlorine Dioxide Generation

ClO\textsubscript{2} was generated using the Minidox-M Decontamination System (Clordisys Solutions, Lebanon, NJ). Minidox is an EPA-registered antimicrobial sterilizer (EPA registration 80802-1). ClO\textsubscript{2} gaseous decontamination of microorganisms has 3 critical elements: ClO\textsubscript{2} concentration, relative humidity, and exposure time. Minidox continuously monitors these critical elements to ensure target levels during exposure time. ClO\textsubscript{2} gas was removed from both the chamber and the hospital patient care room by means of an activated charcoal scrubber.

Bedbug Chamber Evaluations

Bedbugs were collected and identified by an entomologist from local residences. C. lectularius and C. hemipterus were the 2 species recovered in approximately the same numbers. The insects included a mixture of adults, juveniles, and eggs. Bedbugs were sorted and placed in groups of 30 (adults and juveniles) into glass flasks. Three flasks of bedbugs were placed in an exposure chamber within a chemical fume hood for each ClO\textsubscript{2} exposure. A control flask of organisms was also maintained for each exposure at 25\textdegree C and 70% relative humidity. This facilitated evaluation of 90 bedbugs with similar numbers of each species in each group—30 in 3 groups for each exposure and a group of 30 control bedbugs for each exposure scenario. All insects were tested within 96 hours after collection. Eggs that were laid by the bedbugs we had collected were exposed in triplicate for groups of 5–10 egg sacks at the 724 parts per million (ppm) exposures. No attempt was made to determine which species of bedbug had laid each egg.

After placement of the insect groups, the decontamination area was sealed to form a gas-tight chamber. Once the area was sealed, relative humidity was increased by the Minidox system. ClO\textsubscript{2} gas was generated in the chamber until the target concentrations (362, 724, and 1,086 ppm) were reached and the desired exposures in parts per million hours (ppm-hours) were achieved. Ambient ClO\textsubscript{2} gas concentrations were monitored in adjacent areas to ensure minimal leakage. After ClO\textsubscript{2} gas exposure was complete, the bedbugs were immediately moved to the ambient air environment and evaluated. They were maintained under the same conditions as the control organisms during the evaluation periods.

The Minidox system allows variation of gas concentration and exposure time, which allowed for adjustment of ppm-hours, the measure of ClO\textsubscript{2} exposure. Temperature ranged from 20\textdegree to 21\textdegree C throughout the exposure periods. Following exposure, all bedbugs (controls and exposed) were evaluated every 6 hours to determine whether they were dead. Bedbugs were determined to be dead during evaluation by a lack of movement when agitated using forceps for 30 seconds under a dissecting scope, the standard practice for determination of bedbug mortality.\textsuperscript{15} After insects were labeled as dead, they were evaluated every 6 hours for an additional 96 hours and then evaluated daily over 2 weeks for confirmation. All bedbug eggs were maintained at an optimal temperature of 25\textdegree C in ambient air and relative humidity of 70% for 4 weeks to determine whether they remained viable, which is twice as long as the eggs normally take to hatch.\textsuperscript{10}

Hospital Room Evaluation for Chlorine Dioxide Penetration and Material Compatibility

The ClO\textsubscript{2} generator was set up outside a patient care hospital room in the Nebraska Medical Center. Tubing ran from the generator under the door and into the room to provide gas flow, ClO\textsubscript{2} sampling, and in-room monitoring of temperature and relative humidity. A 10-inch portable fan was placed in the room 2 feet from the gas inflow to help distribute the gas throughout the room. A portable steamer (not included with the Minidox system) was added to the room and con-
controlled from outside the room to maintain relative humidity. Biological indicators were placed in the room. Duct tape and plastic were used to seal the room. This process took less than 1 hour. ClO$_2$ was generated as described above, and a total of 6 runs were completed, with each run taking less than 3 hours. A PortSens (Analytical Technology, Oaks, PA) portable gas detector was used to monitor for ClO$_2$ outside the room during exposure periods. ClO$_2$ gas was removed from the hospital patient care room by means of an activated charcoal scrubber, a piece of equipment separate from the Minidox system. The gas was absorbed by the activated charcoal, and no liquid or other material was generated. The gas was cleared from the room during the aeration process in approximately 30 minutes to the safe concentration of 0.1 ppm; however, the smell of the gas was present in the room for 2–3 hours following completion of the protocol.

*B. atropheus* spore strip (Raven Labs; catalog 1-6100) biological indicators were used to validate ClO$_2$ penetration. Each of these biological indicator strips are impregnated with a median value of 10$^5$ spores contained in sterile Tyvek envelopes for aseptic processing (http://www.mesalabs.com/products-services/raven-labs/RCTkit-CIO2.html). These biological indicators are the standard for determining ClO$_2$ decontamination and require a relative humidity of approximately 65%. Biological indicators were placed at 15 sites throughout the hospital room in duplicate pairs, including several inaccessible sites (Table 1). Indicator placement sites 1–10 represent locations throughout the room selected to ensure complete room coverage, including places bedbugs were likely to inhabit. Biological indicator placement sites 11–15 were located inside medical devices. Following exposure to ClO$_2$, gas, indicators were processed according to manufacturer recommendations and incubated in tryptic soy broth at 35°C for 7 days. Positive and negative controls of biological indicators were performed for each run.

In addition to the biological indicators, several pieces of electronic equipment (Table 1), furniture, bedding, and various fabric and material samples were placed in the room for qualitative evaluation of the impact of ClO$_2$. These items were present during all 6 runs and were evaluated at the completion of the room study to determine whether they still were operational or underwent any material change in either texture or coloration.

### Results

The ability of ClO$_2$ to exterminate bedbugs in the laboratory setting is presented in Table 2. Given the information regarding the hardiness of bedbugs and their resistance to pesticides, higher concentrations of ClO$_2$ were initially used. As shown in Table 2, 100% mortality was achieved under each scenario by the 18-hour postexposure time point even when a lower ClO$_2$ concentration (362 ppm) was used. There was no mortality in the control groups throughout the study, and no difference in susceptibility was identified between *C. lectularius* and *C. hemipterus*.

The ability of ClO$_2$ to penetrate throughout a hospital patient care room and into various medical devices was evaluated under the conditions described in Table 3. Six room decontaminations were completed to expose *B. atropheus* indicators to ClO$_2$. The target ClO$_2$ concentration used for the hospital room evaluation was 360 ppm, which was selected because of the substantial bedbug mortality achieved at 360 ppm in the experimental chamber. Additionally, *B. atropheus* has been shown (J. J. Lowe et al., unpublished data) to require approximately 720 ppm-hours of exposure to achieve a 6-log reduction.

Decontamination trials 1–4 used open doors on a metal cabinet and bathroom, resulting in 6-log reductions at all 10 room sites. Trials 5 and 6 were carried out with cabinet and bathroom doors closed to evaluate the gas’s ability to penetrate closed compartments. Trials 5 and 6 resulted in a mean 3-log reduction of *B. atropheus* spores at site 9 (bathroom sink). All other room placement sites resulted in a 6-log reduction or complete inactivation, including site 8 in the closed cabinet.

*B. atropheus* indicators placed inside medical devices (sites 11–15) were evaluated during 6 hospital room decontaminations (Table 3). Complete inactivation (6-log reduction) of *B. atropheus* indicators was observed at placement sites inside the ventilator (site 12), computer keyboard (site 14), and linen bag (site 15). A 6-log reduction was not achieved within a pulse oximeter unit (site 11) or the specimen incubator (site 13).

Qualitative evaluation of the 50 fabric and material samples placed in the room showed no visible color damage or changes in material texture, with one exception. A clear plastic

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>ClO$_2$ concentration</th>
<th>Exposure time, minutes</th>
<th>Exposure, ppm-hours</th>
<th>Relative humidity, %</th>
<th>Mortality after exposure to ClO$_2$, % (SD)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1,086 ppm</td>
<td>167</td>
<td>3,024</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>724 ppm</td>
<td>94</td>
<td>1,132</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>362 ppm</td>
<td>176</td>
<td>1,029</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>84.3 (4.8) 100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>362 ppm</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>519</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>59.8 (14.5) 86.9 (6.3) 98 (1.8) 100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note.** All trials were performed at temperatures of 20°–21°C. ppm-hours, parts per million hours; SD, standard deviation.
sample did become yellow, similar to the ClO\textsubscript{2} gas. All electronic devices remained fully functional.

**DISCUSSION**

Conventional chemical treatment of bedbugs requires that the bedbug move through the applied pesticide, and a residual must be maintained for several weeks after treatment. This does not guarantee complete bedbug removal, as some bedbug populations may not move to feed or hatch until after the pesticide has dissipated. Pesticides then have to be reapplied while humans are occupying the space, which can result in adverse effects in humans.\textsuperscript{9} These human health effects can be reduced or avoided by following proper procedures and regulations; however, this does not always occur. Even when pesticides are applied properly, there are a number of factors associated with their persistence in the environment that can contribute to human illness.\textsuperscript{9}

In our evaluations of the hospital room in our study, we did detect levels of ClO\textsubscript{2} outside the hospital room. Tape reinforcement eliminated the detection. No gas was detected on the floor below the exposure room, in the adjacent room, or more than several feet beyond the taped doors, all of which were off limits to all but study personnel to maintain safety. Study personnel wore proper personal protective equipment as they conducted evaluations. There were no adverse events reported during the study.

Bedbugs are widely known to live in cracks and crevices at close proximity to their human food source.\textsuperscript{16} Healthcare facilities face numerous challenges associated with bedbugs, which can enter through a number of routes, mainly with patients and visitors.\textsuperscript{16} Healthcare facilities and other public facilities must be able to remediate any potential infestation with minimal interruption to operations. Any remediation must be done quickly to allow for room or space occupancy and to confine spread. Avoidance of harmful chemical residuals that may adversely impact a vulnerable patient population is optimal. Standard methods for bedbug remediation often make it difficult to meet these goals. Temperature-related controls are time and labor intensive, and bedbugs have been found to be resistant to a number of conventional pesticides that maintain residuals.\textsuperscript{17}

The resistance of bedbugs to pesticides, such as pyrethroids, coupled with concerns related to human exposure to persistent chemical control measures led to the evaluation of other options for bedbug control.\textsuperscript{15} In our study, it would take about 2 hours of exposure time with 362 ppm of ClO\textsubscript{2} to achieve 100% mortality at 18 hours. After exposure time has been achieved, the ClO\textsubscript{2} can be removed with a scrubber, allowing humans to safely enter the room in under 30 minutes.

It is important that the agent used for bedbug eradication kills adult bedbugs and bedbug eggs. In our study, 100% mortality of all stages of the bedbug life cycle 0 hours after exposure was achieved with 724 ppm for 1,132 ppm-hours, which could be useful in multiple environments. This concentration has been maintained safely in hospital and university rooms for longer periods of time than necessary to achieve the 1,132 ppm-hours of exposure (J. J. Lowe et al., unpublished data). ClO\textsubscript{2} was found to achieve 100% mortality 18 hours after exposure for all concentrations evaluated, down to a concentration of 362 ppm for 89 minutes. ClO\textsubscript{2} is a toxic compound that requires training and personal protective equipment to work with, as are the other compounds currently used for bedbug control. ClO\textsubscript{2} detectors can detect any leak coming from a sealed room, which can be quickly stopped with duct tape. Additionally, the odor threshold for ClO\textsubscript{2} is approximately 0.1 ppm; hence, one can smell the gas at concentrations much lower than those that have adverse human health effects.\textsuperscript{18}

Limitations of our study include that it was a small pilot study and that bedbugs were not placed in a hospital room. Spores were used in the hospital room as a surrogate for bedbugs, and ClO\textsubscript{2} demonstrated excellent killing activity and penetration in the laboratory and against the bedbug surrogates in the hospital room. The spores used in the room are well-known ClO\textsubscript{2} biological indicators because of their difficulty to kill. We did not conduct formal structural testing of synthetic materials and electronic equipment used within hospital rooms. Additionally, further evaluation may be

---

**Table 3. Chlorine Dioxide (ClO\textsubscript{2}) Reduction of Bacillus atropheus Spores Inside Medical Equipment by Site Number**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trial number</th>
<th>ClO\textsubscript{2} concentration, ppm</th>
<th>Exposure time, minutes</th>
<th>Exposure, ppm-hours</th>
<th>Relative humidity, %</th>
<th>B. atropheus spore log reduction by site a</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>352</td>
<td>116</td>
<td>677</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>3.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>377</td>
<td>142</td>
<td>890</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>5.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>379</td>
<td>121</td>
<td>767</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>385</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>770</td>
<td>65</td>
<td>6.0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>376</td>
<td>126</td>
<td>788</td>
<td>64</td>
<td>2.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>383</td>
<td>122</td>
<td>781</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>4.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note. All trials were performed at temperatures of 21°–24°C. ppm-hours, parts per million hours.

a See Table 1 for site numbers.*
needed to determine the proper aeration time for areas with extensive porous surfaces.

The results of this study are encouraging and demonstrate that ClO₂ may be useful for eradication of bedbugs. Further study is necessary to determine the effects of gaseous ClO₂ on bedbug infestations in the healthcare environment and in other settings (e.g., hotels and businesses) where they have been found. Further studies involving the application of ClO₂ to a bedbug-infested area and evaluation of its practical use are necessary.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

We thank Dr Tom Janousek for field collection of bedbugs. We also thank Kevin Lorcheim of Clordisys Solutions for technical support and providing some equipment.

Financial support. This work was supported by the Nebraska Patient Care Biocontainment Unit at the Nebraska Medical Center. Additionally, the Minidox-M Decontamination System is on loan to the research group from Clordisys Solutions. However, Clordisys is not part of the research team, party to experimental design, or aware of the results of this article. Clordisys has put no conditions on our use of the Minidox system beyond that we return it when we are done.

Potential conflicts of interest. All authors report no conflicts of interest relevant to this article. All authors submitted the ICMJE Form for Disclosure of Potential Conflicts of Interest, and the conflicts that the editors consider relevant to this article. All authors submitted the ICMJE Form for Disclosure of Potential Conflicts of Interest, and the conflicts that the editors consider relevant to this article are disclosed here.

Address correspondence to Shawn G. Gibbs, PhD, Department of Environmental, Agricultural and Occupational Health, University of Nebraska Medical Center College of Public Health, 985110 Nebraska Medical Center, Omaha, NE 68198 (sgibbs@unmc.edu).

REFERENCES